Appendix 1 – Response to the 37 Trans Scrutiny Panel Recommendations

No.	Recommendation	Response
contracted by the council) need to en that they have, as far as possible, related up to date information on the nur	Public service providers (including those contracted by the council) need to ensure that they have, as far as possible, relevant and up to date information on the number of trans people using their services and what they require of that service.	Recommendation Accepted The council's equalities monitoring form asks questions about all the legally protected characteristics. In the 'Gender' section the possible responses are 'Male', 'Female' and 'Other – please specify' (with a choice of 'prefer not to say'). There is also a question about gender identity, informed by national best practice guidance. The question is: 'Is your gender identity the same as the gender you were assigned at birth?' This form is the standard template which should be used by all services and it is accompanied by guidance which explains the purpose of equalities monitoring, how information is used (and kept anonymous), and what the questions mean. In addition Equality Impact Assessments (EIA) are used to identify (potential) impacts of services, policies and activities on all legally protected groups, including Trans people. EIAs consider data and community engagement to identify actions that need to be taken to improve the service to meet needs. (Communities & Equality Team)
		The Corporate Procurement team will explore the possibility of including a request for "relevant and up to date information of the number of trans people using their service and what they require of that service" be included within Stage 3 Pre tender risk assessment document used in corporate procurement team. This would enable consideration to this need to be given and included in relevant procurement activities. Working with contract officers from across council services, the corporate procurement team will be exploring how equalities monitoring of contracts can be improved to adequately and appropriately ensure data about Trans service users is collected and used. (Corporate Procurement)

-	₽
-	7
•	J.

2	There is an obvious need for specific trans awareness training for front line staff both in the council and in partner organisations. The council should take the lead in both providing specific training for its own staff, including senior officers, and encouraging other local agencies to do so.	Recommendation Accepted
		The Panel made a number of recommendations regarding training for front line and other staff in a range of council services and partners organisations as well as for members. The council's Workforce Development Team will support and co-ordinate training as need is identified. Initially awareness training will be offered, followed by more specific training as needs are identified. The procurement of Trans awareness training for housing staff is underway.
		The training will be used as a pilot and used to determined appropriate next steps for wide organisational provision in light of available funding including training for councillors. The team will also assess what if any training has already been delivered on the subject either by the council or public partners. It will also establish a consultative group to include representatives from equalities, police, community safety, and democratic services to explore joint working and avoid duplication. Future training and development will also be informed by the outcome of the needs assessment.
		(Workforce Development)
3	The council should ensure that all Councillors undertake trans awareness training.	Recommendation Accepted See response to recommendation no.2 (Democratic Services and L&D)
4	Given the state of uncertainty around the	Recommendation Accepted
	future commissioning of gender identity services, it is imperative that there is a local Brighton & Hove professional within the Local Area Team (LAT) of the NHS Commissioning Board to ensure the views of the local trans population are fed into those who commission services. This named individual should be experienced in working	Fiona Makison has been identified as the lead for the Local Area Team. (NHS CB Area Team)
	with the trans community and be given	

	explicit responsibility for ongoing engagement between the LAT and the trans community.	
5	The Local Area Team should review current practices on how personal information is gathered and stored and, through the CCG, offer guidance on the correct procedures.	Recommendation Accepted in Principle Lead officer will be exploring this recommendation with the Area Team. (NHS CB Area Team)
6	The Clinical Commissioning Group (CCG) needs to mandate a rolling programme of trans awareness training for all CCG and GP practice staff and specifically improve the trans patient experience on the scorecard for GP surgeries. As part of this, the Panel recommend that an action plan must be put in place to ensure that real change occurs.	Recommendation Accepted The CCG recognises the importance accessible and welcoming general practice plays in the transgender community's experience of care. A half days training event for Excluded Groups which will include a specific focus on the Trans community will be delivered as part of the Protected Learning Scheme (PLS) training programme in 2013-2014. This will include all staff within the Surgery, ie Practice Nurses, GPs and reception staff. The CCG will explore the option for patient feedback on accessibility to be included in the updated balance scorecard of local Surgeries. A Lead Commissioning Manager for Excluded Groups has just been added to the CCG staffing structure. The remit of this post will be to ensure the needs of excluded groups (including a specific focus on the transgender community) are appropriately reflected in the CCG's commissioning plans and to liaise with the Area Team to ensure continuity of pathways. (Clinical Commissioning Group)
7	The GP electronic check-in should be changed to remove the need to identify as Male or Female on arrival at the surgery, using alternatively surname and date of birth. In addition, patients should be provided with the option to use a non-gender specific honorific or to decline to provide one	Recommendation Accepted in Principle Whilst this specific action is not within the ability of the CCG to mandate, it will be raised with the training event for GPs for their consideration. (Clinical Commissioning Group)

	T	1
·	•	
	2	α

	on NHS systems.	
8	Given the importance of GPs as the first point of contact for trans or gender-questioning people, the Clinical Commissioning Group needs to ensure that all GPs in the city are fully aware of the appropriate care pathways for gender identity services and health needs of trans individuals. As part of this, GPs must ensure all their staff are trans aware and understand their role in supporting patients on the care pathway.	Recommendation Accepted in Principle The half day's training event will contain information on the health needs of the community and details on pathways of care for gender identify services. In addition the CCG's intranet (for member practices) will incorporate details on pathways of care and other local/national support services. (Clinical Commissioning Group)
9	Patients and others will need access to information about the gender identity care pathway. The Panel recommend that the Clinical Commissioning Group commissions an online resource and print resource to provide information for patients.	Recommendation Accepted in Principle In addition to the Intranet for member practices the CCG is currently in the process of establishing a public facing web-site. We will ensure it incorporates information for patients and the public about gender identity pathways and support services. (Clinical Commissioning Group)
10	The Clinical Commissioning Group should set up a feasibility study and pilot to develop a central Brighton practice as a centre for GPs with special interest in gender identity healthcare. This should ensure best practice is developed and meets the needs of patients undergoing gender identity transition.	Recommendation Accepted in Principle The responsibility for commissioning enhanced services such as this will transfer to the CCG on 1st April 2013. All current enhances services will be reviewed and this recommendation will be discussed and considered by the Primary Care Development Group. (Clinical Commissioning Group)

-	-
í	$\overline{}$
•	$\mathbf{\mathcal{L}}$

11	The Joint Strategic Needs Assessment	Recommendation Accepted
	(JSNA) should more accurately reflect the needs of trans people, particularly regarding suicide prevention. As part of this, health	Will be actioned in 2013 JSNA update by September 2013 (subject to approval of Health and Wellbeing Board)
	bodies in the city need to clarify what mental health support there is for people both on the trans care pathway and people who are not on the pathway but need support.	(Public Health)
12	Given the concerns of the trans community	Recommendation Accepted in Principle
	over the lack of local gender identity services, a feasibility exercise should be	This recommendation will be raised and discussed with the Area Team.
	conducted by the National Commissioning Board LAT and CCG to commission a Gender Identity Clinic to provide a satellite service to operate from Brighton & Hove on a regular basis. This must be informed by consultation with the trans community. In addition, the CCG needs also to show it is being pro-active in bringing influence to bear on the NCB to ensure improvements are made in Gender Identity Clinics.	(Clinical Commissioning Group)
40	·	
13	The Panel welcome the Clinical Commissioning Group's commitment to work with the council on commissioning a trans needs assessment for the city. The Panel recommend that as a matter of some urgency a needs assessment needs to be undertaken to identify the size of the trans community and its needs. Trans people must be involved at every stage of this process from design, commissioning,	Initial scoping to be considered at City Wide Needs Assessment Steering Group in May 2013. To be informed in advance by NHS CCG, BHCC public health, housing, leisure, employment, social care, equalities team, community safety, CYP services, LGBT Health & Inclusion Project. Scoping will include consideration of further community involvement. (Public Health)

	implementation, analysis, reporting and influencing in order to inspire the trust of the trans community. The current public health Joint Strategic Needs Assessment (JSNA) must be updated to reflect this information.	
14	The Panel recommend that the public health team take action to identify the health status of the trans population, and put in place a robust plan for reducing any health inequalities for trans people in the city. As part of this the Joint Strategic Needs Assessment (JSNA) needs to be updated to address the health inequalities noted in this report.	Recommendation Accepted Health inequalities to be included in scope of Trans Needs Assessment (recommendation 13). Health inequalities to be included in scope of recommendation City Wide Trans Strategy (Recommendation 32). (Public Health)
15	During the upcoming revision of housing strategies (homelessness, LGBT housing) the views of the trans community should be actively sought. Specifically, the Housing Options service should be reviewed to ensure that it is widely known about and used by trans people in housing need. A programme of outreach to the trans community to publicise the assistance available from the housing department should be undertaken.	Recommendation Accepted In accordance with housing consultation and diversity policies it will be actively seeking the views of the trans community in relation to housing policy development and very much welcome information and evidence on detailed housing needs and requirements to help inform consultation and outreach work. Resourcing a specific Options outreach service will be explored. (Housing)
16	The Housing department should also commence a programme of awareness	Recommendation Accepted
	raising about the legal protections for trans	See recommendation no. 2
	people in housing provision and promote	Housing will incorporate the housing needs, issues and legal protections concerning the

•	_	4
_		`
-		

	good practice within social and private landlords.	trans community into its learning and development programme for managers and staff drawing on available statistical evidence, results of consultation and outreach work to better understand the current housing requirements of communities of interest. (Housing)
17	Further work should be undertaken to address the transphobia and discrimination faced by older trans people such as in accessing adult social care services, supported housing and care homes (for example, personal care). As part of this, training on trans awareness and the needs of older trans people needs to be put in place for care homes and sheltered housing providers contracting with the council.	Recommendation Accepted See response to recommendation no.2 Housing will raise awareness and challenge potentially discriminatory practices and behaviours toward trans-gender people in its learning and development and personal development plans. It will seek to pay particular attention to service areas where transgender discrimination could potentially arise. (Housing) In regards to adult social care provision transphobia is addressed through the Personalisation agenda. Care is person centred and tailored to individual need. Celebration of diversity is key to service provision and integral within commissioned services. The outcomes of the scrutiny panel report have been shared within the Commissioning Support Unit and will inform the care governance arrangements of care services to ensure a focus on these issues. (Adult Social Ccare)
18	The robust recording of police and community safety data on trans-related crimes and incidents should be developed and used to inform preventative measures. Further work needs to be undertaken to encourage reporting of hate crime. Building on existing relationships, an action plan needs to be put in place by the community safety team in conjunction with Sussex	Police and Casework Team to be requested to develop systems which identify recorded crimes and incidents reported by those who are transgender. That data and information to be managed in such a way that it can used to inform the quarterly and annual performance monitoring reports which are provided to the Safe In the City Partnership. The Casework Team, together with the police hate crime community engagement officers, has already taken action aimed at increasing trust and confidence and reporting of transphobic crimes and incidents. That work to be sustained and its effectiveness regularly reviewed together

ഗ	
N	
. •	

		Police to address low levels of hate crime reporting including trans related incidents.	with information on reporting levels and performance against agreed indicators. (Partnership Community Safety Team)
	19	The Panel recommend that Sussex Police provide trans awareness training for its staff, in conjunction with the community safety team.	Recommendation Accepted The integrated community safety Delivery Unit and Neighbourhood Policing Teams to undertake transgender awareness training, linking in with activity of the workforce development team (see recommendation no.2). Discussions to take place with Sussex Police about the inclusion of transgender awareness within the comprehensive training plans for police officers. (Partnership Community Safety Team)
52	20	The council must continue to actively support the work of the Healthy Schools Team and Allsorts to provide guidance and support to trans children and young people. As part of this, the resources given to this work should reflect the demands on the service. In addition, specific trans awareness training should be provided in schools, as well to general LGBT training.	Recommendation Accepted Healthy Schools and Allsorts are in the process of developing a Trans Toolkit for Schools which is being consulted on and will be launched in the Summer term. Building capacity within schools delivers a sustainable approach to on going trans awareness in schools. This is supported by bespoke support for individual schools as requested and from ongoing work of Allsorts, for example, Allsorts provide support to secondary age trans students and to parents and carers of primary and secondary age trans children and young people, joint delivery of teacher training in one school and a pilot workshop for Year 10 students on gender identity / trans at Varndean. (Children's Services) Allsorts have been awarded a three year strategic discretionary grant – £22,000 per annum 2013-2016. (Communities and Equality)

C		
Ć	٠,	

22

The Panel welcomes the commitment from the sports facilities team that they will engage with the trans community. The Panel recommends that trans individuals are consulted in future facilities planning, and are also consulted and involved in helping to develop trans safe and trans only exercise sessions.

Recommendation Accepted

Sports Facilities are exploring in conjunction with The Clare Project the establishment of a transgender swimming session at St Luke's Swimming Pool. This would be similar to the successful women only sessions established at St Luke's for the Muslim community. Signage on new or refurbished changing rooms and toilets is being reviewed and Sports Facilities are developing on-going consultation with representatives of the transgender community to ensure the most appropriate wording / symbols for this signage. In the longer term the needs of the transgender community will be considered as part of any specification for new-build facilities – for example the redevelopment of the King Alfred Leisure Centre which is a current live project.

(Sport & Leisure)

There should be provision for accessible and gender neutral toilets in all areas. The council should take the first step, with consultation with trans individuals, to ensure gender neutral and accessible toilets are available in public buildings. Where appropriate, this process should involve consultation with other groups affected such as disabled people who may have a view about widening access to toilet facilities designated as accessible for disabled people.

Recommendation Accepted

Property and Design, in consultation with disability groups and the trans community will explore the possibility of existing accessible toilets in council public buildings being used as an inclusive facility for all.

(Property and Design)

Cityclean has been promoting inclusive public toilet provision in response to an Equality Impact Assessment on toilet provision in 2012 and in line with the Equality Act. Cityclean trys to make new public toilets fully accessible wherever space allows. The new designs tend to be single use cubicles and are larger than standard units to cater for accessibility. You enter directly from street level so that users are clearly visible and misuse and anti social behaviour is reduced. Where possible the service works with developers (large tourist developments) to advise on provision and would recommend the same design, recently working successful with i360 developers. The service also has a toilet user group and will be contacting LGBT HIP to explore how the Trans voice can be represented.

(Cityclean)

C	
Ĺ	\leq

23	Individual changing rooms should be available in all leisure buildings and the council should actively encourage other organisations to provide changing rooms that are appropriate for all users, whatever their gender identity.	Recommendation Accepted See recommendation no. 21 (Sport & Leisure)
24	The council's Trans Toolkit is due to be revised. The Panel recommends that the council take advice from experts in trans awareness to ensure the toolkit is fit for purpose. This new Toolkit should then be proactively publicised and promoted to all staff within the council. Managers should be offered training on its use. In addition, guidance should be given for council staff on what to do when a person changes their name and gender marker following a gender transition.	Recommendation Accepted HR has already started reviewing the Transgender Toolkit and will have regard to the recommendations made by the Scrutiny Panel whilst carrying out that exercise and when relaunching the revised toolkit. (HR)
25	B&HCC Human Resources, in partnership with the LGBT Workers' Forum and the Communities and Equalities Team, need to reach out to trans employees to listen to their experiences of working for the council and to make changes accordingly. The B&HCC LGBT Worker' Forum is to be congratulated on their activities on trans inclusion. The Forum must continue to be supported and resourced to develop its work	Recommendation Accepted The LGBT workers forum has prioritised Trans engagement work and support for a number of years, having played a pivotal role in the instigation of the Trans Equality Scrutiny and will continue to do so. The forum continues to receive an annual budget and support from the communities and equality team to deliver its annual business plan, currently being worked on. Reaching out to trans employees has also been discussed at the workforce equalities group attended by representatives from all the workers forums, HR and communities and equality team. (HR, LGBT Workers Forum and Communities & Equality)

	on this.	
26	The particular impacts on trans people of the government welfare reform agenda must be taken into account. As part of this, the specific vulnerabilities of trans people as recipients of welfare benefits should be explicitly acknowledged in the council's strategy on financial inclusion.	Recommendation Accepted The Council's new Financial Inclusion Strategy has recently been adopted. The specific needs of the trans community were considered as part of the needs and equality impact assessments and will be included in all elements of commissioning and delivery going forward. In particular advice providers have been asked to undertake service monitoring of trans clients and to undertake LGBT awareness training in relation to this. The new Community Banking Partnership commission will also include these actions. (Communities & Equality)
27	When appointed, the Council's Trans Champion (see recommendation 36) should contact local high street banks, building societies and East Sussex Credit Union to encourage sharing best practice regarding staff training/awareness and bank records procedures for trans customers.	Recommendation Accepted The Council has recently adopted a new financial inclusion strategy which includes actions around working with high street banks. With this in mind it is proposed that the work on trans inclusion be added to this process. (Communities & Equality)
28	All public bodies (including NHS bodies and schools) should publish an annual statement on what they have done to meet their public sector equality duty in respect of trans people.	Recommendation Accepted The council is incorporating the agreed recommendations of the Trans Equality Scrutiny into the Equality and Inclusion Policy Action Plan. This is updated and publicly reported every six month, and progress is reported to Overview and Scrutiny annually. The City Inclusion Partnership (an equality and inclusion forum for all the city's statutory organisations) has a focus in 2013 on identifying recommendations in the Scrutiny which would benefit from a citywide approach and on working together to implement the actions

29	City-wide there needs to be wider	Recommendation Accepted
	recognition of non-binary gender. Further discussion should be undertaken with the trans community to ensure that all monitoring is sensitive, appropriate and properly implemented. Furthermore, the	As in response to recommendation no.1 the council's equality monitoring form recognises non-binary gender identity and allows people to define their own identity. The questions and guidance for the form are based on guidance from Trans organisations. Guidance for staff on how to ask the questions appropriately and sensitively has also been produced.
	results of this monitoring, appropriately anonymised, should be made publicly available on an annual basis.	The council's HR team is updating its monitoring categories to reflect the corporate template and will use this to collect data. Monitoring data on staff is reported annually, and figures for Trans staff will be separated, where this does not risk identifying individuals.
		Equality information on service-users is also collected using the council form and this data is reported via the council's Equality Impact Assessment process. Summaries of these are published on the council's website as EIAs are completed and copies of the full EIAs are available on request.
		(Communities & Equality)
30	The importance of an on-going mechanism for consultation and engagement with trans people in the city should be recognised by the council. The Panel recommend that this should be funded accordingly	Recommendation Accepted The council is funding the LGBT Health and Inclusion Project for a further year (2013-14) in recognition of the excellent engagement and consultation it has delivered. The project is jointly funded by the council and clinical commissioning group, both of which will work with the project in 2013/14 to secure its sustainability.
		(Communities & Equality)
31	Infrastructure services and the Transforming Local Infrastructure (TLI) project should continue to consider how to engage the city's trans community groups to ensure they	Recommendation Accepted in Principle This recommendation has been fed back to the four voluntary organisations leading and delivering the new TLI project (funded by the Big Lottery) and as a member of the strategic working group advising the project the communities and equality team has championed the

working group advising the project the communities and equality team has championed the

and share best practice.

(Communities & Equality)

•	J	•	ı
۰,	•		ı
		8	۰

	have an active voice in decision making.	need for the new organisation to explicitly explain how it will support equalities groups, including Trans groups, in the city. At time of writing the final paper on the services to be delivered by the TLI had not been released to the council by the project.
		The need to support Trans community groups has been explicitly included in the Community and Voluntary Sector Forum's contract for 2013/14 in readiness for its change into the new TLI organisation.
		TLI lead organisations
		(Communities and Equality)
32	Following the needs assessment (see recommendation 13) a city wide trans equalities strategy should be developed by the council and partner organisations with the full engagement and participation of trans individuals and support groups. This should include an action plan with clear leads and responsibilities. This should be led by the council's Trans Champion (see recommendation 36).	Recommendation Accepted Using the outcomes and recommendations from the needs assessment discussion will be had with the Trans community and public sector organisations about outcomes and recommendations that could appropriately be mainstreamed into existing strategies and the focus required for a specific Trans Strategy. (Communities & Equality)
33	Any activity commissioned or supported by the council in relation to LGBT activities, and in particular Pride, needs to mandate trans inclusion	Recommendation Accepted As a result of the Trans Scrutiny Panel findings, we will ensure that any future commissioning or support for cultural work addressing the Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual and Transgendered agenda takes on board fully the needs and aspirations of Transgendered individuals. In terms of the council's relationship with Pride specifically, the council does not commission Pride and currently does not fund the event directly, although Pride does receive support in kind from the council. Council officers responsible for liaising with Pride would be happy to broker discussions that might result in a greater inclusion of the Trans community in the event.

J	ı
`	1
	₹

		(Culture)
34	B&HCC should take the lead in creating an identity for the city as a trans friendly place that challenges stigma and discrimination. This includes such actions as a public statement on the website, trans branding, vocal support and partnership working with trans support groups, and publicity information including trans individuals as local citizens.	Recommendation Accepted The Communications team will tie in with partners across the city to support and champion the issues raised in the report and work taken forward in response. Wherever needed the team will lead on the publication of information which progresses the agenda of equality for local trans people. (Communications)
35	The Panel welcome the addition of the honorific Mx by council benefits staff as giving an alternative option. The Panel recommend that all on-line forms are examined to look at the possibility of additional options, leaving blank or entering the title the individual feels is appropriate to them.	Recommendation Accepted Online forms are being reviewed as part of the council's Web Improvement Project as more forms are automated. Each form will be evaluated before Mx is included as a standard title. This will ensure that where data is automatically put into back office systems it is compatible and Mx will be accepted as an option along with an option of leaving the honorific blank. Progress will be monitored and reported back to the Customer Access Programme Board. (City Services)
36	The implementation of these recommendations is crucial and should be carefully monitored. The Panel recommends that a lead officer is appointed as a 'Trans Champion' within the council. This person should be at Senior Management level (within the Corporate Management Team or Assistant Director level or above) and will be responsible to champion the rights of trans people both inside and outside of the organisation. They will also have responsibility for the commissioning of the	Recommendation Accepted The Executive Director for Resources, Catherine Vaughan has been appointed as the equalities champion for the Executive Leadership Team (ELT). This includes championing Trans issues. Progress on the responses to the recommendations will be reported in November to the ELT. The councillor Trans champion will be nominated as part of annual council process. (Communities and Equality)

	trans needs assessment and the lead on the development of a city-wide Trans Equalities Strategy (see recommendation 32). In addition, a councillor should be nominated as the council's Trans-Champion (as distinct from the existing LGBT champion).	
37	The work of this Panel should be forwarded on to the government departments looking at trans equality, specifically in response to the expected call for evidence after the Trans Gender Equalities Action Plan.	Actioned by Scrutiny Team following report's endorsement by Overview and Scrutiny Committee end of January.